



## Carrying a basket along with a stone on Shabbat

The *Mishnah* (21:1) teaches that one may carry a basket that has a stone in it, despite the stone being *muktzeh* and one not being able to handle it on its own.

The *Bartenura* explains the case in the *Mishnah* is where the basket also contains fruit, otherwise the basket would be considered a *basis le'davar assur* (a base for something that is prohibited) and one would not be able to move the basket either. The *Bartenura* further qualifies the case. He explains that the cases must also be where one is unable to shake out stone - the fruit is soft or moist and would spoil if emptied on the ground and cannot be moved to one side in order to shake out the stone. In other words, if we were dealing with dry goods that would not spoil, the basket would need to be empty of its contents to remove the stone, and then refilled with the fruit alone.

The *Bartenura* explains further that the case is where there is a hole in the basket with the stone acting to seal the space. In other words, the stone is necessary for the basket to function. According to the *Rambam's* explanation on the *Mishnah* all these conditions must be fulfilled.

These qualifications are all found in the *Gemara* (*Shabbat* 142a). The *Tosfot Yom Tov* however argues that if the stone is acting as a wall for the basket, that alone should be sufficient to permit carrying the basket. The *Tosfot Yom Tov* directs our attention to the earlier *Mishnah* where we learnt that if a stone was fixed to a pumpkin shell in order to weigh it down when drawing water, then one would be permitted to move the shell. We see that when the stone is necessary for the utensil's function it does not prohibit the handling of the *kli*, so why are the early conditions necessary?

Indeed the *Rambam* appears to change his position in the *Mishnah Torah* explaining that if the stone served as a wall

or if the basket contained wet fruit then one can carry the basket along with the stone. The *Tosfot Yom Tov* however understands from the flow of the *Gemara* that when *Rav* suggests this explanation, the *Gemara* had rejected the previous suggestion that the *Mishnah* was dealing with a case involving fruit that would spoil. We find that this is the *Ravaad's* understanding as well when he questions the *Rambam's* ruling. Either way, we find that when the stone serves as the wall, one may handle the *kli*.

The *Chidushei Mahariach* however defends the *Bartenura* citing the *Tosfot* (second answer). Even if the stone is serving as the wall, the case must still be referring to where the fruit cannot be emptied. Otherwise, one should empty the basket of its contents and transfer the fruit in small amounts using the basket; as much as the basket can contain up until the exposed hole. He continues explaining that the *Tosfot* and *Bartenura* must understand that this case is different to the case involving the pumpkin shell since there it is only permitted once the stone has been set aside for that purpose<sup>1</sup>.

The *Ritva* also explains that *Gemara* in two different ways - whether or not the explanation of the stone serving as the wall is treated independently. Relevant for the defence of the *Bartenura* is his explanation according to the understanding that the stone serving as the wall still requires that there is fruit in the basket. The *Ritva* explains that if the stone was securely fastened to the wall it would be no different to case of the stone in the pumpkin shell. Once it is fastened the stone is considered *batel* (annulled) to the *kli* (utensil). In this case however the stone is not securely fastened. Therefore, it is only when the basket contains fruit that the stone is immediately required and can be considered as part of the *kli*.

*Yisrael Bankier*

<sup>1</sup> The first suggestion of the *Tosfot* is the stone acting as a wall alone is enough of a justification since if we emptied the basket along with the stone then we would not have a utensil in which to place the permitted contents.

**Revision Questions**

שבת י"ט: א' – כ"א: ג'

- Is there a special manner in which one must carry a knife for the *brit millah* if he is carrying it on *Shabbat*? (י"ט: א')
- To what extent does *R' Eliezer* allow *melacha* to be performed on *Shabbat* for a *brit millah*? (י"ט: א')
- What general principle does *R' Akiva* make with respect to performing *melacha* for a *brit millah*? (י"ט: א')
- Are there any differences between a *brit millah* performed on *Shabbat* and a *brit millah* performed on a weekday? (י"ט: ב')
- On which day after the *millah* does *R' Elazar ben Azarya* permit the baby to be washed even on *Shabbat*? (י"ט: ג')
- Explain the debate regarding whether an *androginus* can have a *brit millah* on *Shabbat*. (י"ט: ג')
- The *Mishnah* described two cases where a person has two babies:
  1. One is meant to have a *brit* on *Shabbat* and the other on Sunday.
  2. One is meant to have a *brit* on *erev Shabbat* and the other on *Shabbat*. The *Mishnah* rules that if the wrong baby had its *brit* on *Shabbat* then in one case everyone agrees that the person would be obligated to bring a *chatat* while the other case is debated – which of the two cases is the subject of the debate and why? (י"ט: ד')
- The *Mishnah* explains that it is possible that a healthy baby can have its *brit millah* on the 8<sup>th</sup>, 9<sup>th</sup>, 10<sup>th</sup>, 11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> day – how? (י"ט: ה')
- A *kohen* that has not had a proper *brit millah* is invalid from what? (י"ט: ו')
- *R' Eliezer* and the *Chachamim* debate setting up and using a *mashmeret* on *Shabbat* and on *Yom Tov* – explain the debate and state both opinions. (כ"א: א')
- Can one strain wine on *Shabbat*? (כ"א: ב')
- Can one strain an egg through mustard on *Shabbat*? (כ"א: ב')
- In what manner can one separate the *psolet* from *carshinim* on *Shabbat*? (כ"א: ג')
- Is one allowed to give food separately to each of his animals? (כ"א: ד')
- How can one move about straw placed on their bed (to make it more comfortable)? (List two possibilities) (כ"א: ה')
- Can one carry a child that is holding something *muktza*? (כ"א: ו')
- According to which *Tana* can one separate (replacement) *trumah* from *meduma* produce? (כ"א: ז')
- How does one retrieve wine from a barrel that has a stone resting on its lid? (כ"א: ח')
- What can one do if there is something dirty on their pillow? (כ"א: ט')
- Explain the debate between *Beit Shammai* and *Beit Hillel* regarding removing bones and shells from the *Shabbat* table. (כ"א: י')
- Is one allowed to use a sponge on *Shabbat* to clean a spill? (כ"א: י"א')
- Can sponges become *tameh*? (כ"א: י"ב')

**Melbourne, Australia**

**Sunday -Thursday**

10 minutes before *Mincha*  
Mizrachi Shul  
 Melbourne, Australia

**Friday & Shabbat**

10 minutes before *Mincha*  
Mizrachi Shul  
 Melbourne, Australia

**Efrat, Israel**

*Shiur in English*

**Sunday -Thursday**

Rabbi Mordechai Scharf  
 9:00am  
Kollel Magen Avraham  
 Reemon Neighbourhood

**ONLINE SHIURIM**

*Yisrael Bankier*  
[mishnahyomit.com/shiurim](http://mishnahyomit.com/shiurim)

*Rabbi Chaim Brown*  
[www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/](http://www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/)

*Rabbi E. Kornfeld*  
*Rabbi C. Brown*  
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendar/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

**SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON**

*Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss*  
 In US dial: 718 906 6400  
 Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

**Next Week's Mishnayot...**

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
23 April כ"ז ניסן	24 April כ"ח ניסן	25 April כ"ט ניסן	26 April ל' ניסן	27 April א' אייר	28 April ב' אייר	29 April ג' אייר
Shabbat 22:1-2	Shabbat 22:3-4	Shabbat 22:5-6	Shabbat 23:1-2	Shabbat 23:3-4	Shabbat 23:5-24:1	Shabbat 24:2-3



